

## TO THE HONOURABLE THE LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA

Your Standing Committee on Public Accounts presents the following as its Third Report.

### Meetings

Your Committee met on the following occasions:

- May 8, 2013 (2<sup>nd</sup> Session, 40<sup>th</sup> Legislature)
- June 25, 2013 (2<sup>nd</sup> Session, 40<sup>th</sup> Legislature)
- August 8, 2013 (2<sup>nd</sup> Session, 40<sup>th</sup> Legislature)
- October 9, 2013 (2<sup>nd</sup> Session, 40<sup>th</sup> Legislature)
- October 30, 2013 (2<sup>nd</sup> Session, 40<sup>th</sup> Legislature)
- November 26, 2013 (3<sup>rd</sup> Session, 40<sup>th</sup> Legislature)
- June 26, 2014 (3<sup>rd</sup> Session, 40<sup>th</sup> Legislature)
- September 3, 2014 (3<sup>rd</sup> Session, 40<sup>th</sup> Legislature)
- January 28, 2015 (4<sup>th</sup> Session, 40<sup>th</sup> Legislature)
- May 21, 2015 (4<sup>th</sup> Session, 40<sup>th</sup> Legislature)
- September 29, 2015 (4<sup>th</sup> Session, 40<sup>th</sup> Legislature)
- June 30, 2016 (1<sup>st</sup> Session, 41<sup>st</sup> Legislature)
- August 17, 2016 at 1:00 p.m. (1<sup>st</sup> Session, 41<sup>st</sup> Legislature)

### Matters under Consideration

- Auditor General's Report – Annual Report to the Legislature – dated January 2013
  - Chapter 7 – Provincial Nominee Program for Business
- Auditor General's Report – Follow-Up of Previously Issued Recommendations – dated May 2015
  - Section 8 – Special Needs Education
  - Section 14 – Manitoba Early Learning and Child Care Program
  - Section 17 – Provincial Nominee Program for Business
- Auditor General's Report – Follow-Up of Previously Issued Recommendations – dated May 2016
  - Special Needs Education
  - Manitoba Early Learning and Child Care Program
  - Provincial Nominee Program for Business
- Auditor General's Report – Improving Educational Outcomes for Kindergarten to Grade 12 Aboriginal Students – dated January 2016

### Committee Membership

Committee membership for the May 8, 2013 meeting:

- Mr. ALLUM
- Ms. BRAUN
- Mr. CULLEN
- Mr. DEWAR (*Vice-Chairperson*)
- Mrs. DRIEDGER
- Hon. Mr. GERRARD
- Mr. HELWER (*Chairperson*)
- Mr. JHA
- Mr. MARCELINO
- Mr. PEDERSEN
- Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS

Substitutions received prior to committee proceedings on May 8, 2013:

- Mr. MARCELINO for Mr. WHITEHEAD

Committee membership for the June 25, 2013 meeting:

- Mr. ALLUM
- Ms. BRAUN
- Mr. CULLEN
- Mr. DEWAR (*Vice-Chairperson*)
- Mrs. DRIEDGER
- Hon. Mr. GERRARD
- Mr. HELWER (*Chairperson*)
- Mr. JHA

- Mr. PEDERSEN
- Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS
- Mr. WHITEHEAD

Committee membership for the August 8, 2013 meeting:

- Mr. ALLUM
- Ms. BRAUN
- Mr. CULLEN
- Mr. DEWAR (*Vice-Chairperson*)
- Mrs. DRIEDGER
- Mr. GAUDREAU
- Hon. Mr. GERRARD
- Mr. HELWER (*Chairperson*)
- Mr. JHA
- Mr. PEDERSEN
- Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS

Substitutions received prior to committee proceedings on August 8, 2013:

- Mr. GAUDREAU for Mr. WHITEHEAD

Committee membership for the October 9, 2013 meeting:

- Mr. ALLUM
- Mr. CULLEN
- Mr. DEWAR (*Vice-Chairperson*)
- Mrs. DRIEDGER
- Hon. Mr. GERRARD
- Mr. HELWER (*Chairperson*)
- Mr. JHA
- Mr. MARCELINO
- Mr. PEDERSEN
- Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS
- Mr. WHITEHEAD

Substitutions received prior to committee proceedings on October 9, 2013:

- Mr. MARCELINO for Ms. BRAUN

Committee membership for the October 30, 2013 meeting:

- Ms. CROTHERS
- Mr. DEWAR (*Vice-Chairperson*)
- Mrs. DRIEDGER
- Mr. EWASKO
- Hon. Mr. GERRARD
- Mr. HELWER (*Chairperson*)
- Hon. Ms. HOWARD
- Mr. MARCELINO
- Mr. PEDERSEN
- Mr. SARAN
- Mr. WIEBE

Substitutions received prior to committee proceedings on October 30, 2013:

- Mr. MARCELINO for Mr. JHA
- Mr. SARAN for Mr. WHITEHEAD
- Mr. EWASKO for Mr. CULLEN

Committee membership for the November 26, 2013 meeting:

- Hon. Mr. ALLUM
- Mr. CULLEN
- Mr. DEWAR (*Vice-Chairperson*)
- Mrs. DRIEDGER
- Hon. Mr. GERRARD
- Mr. HELWER (*Chairperson*)
- Mr. JHA
- Mr. PEDERSEN

- Mr. WHITEHEAD
- Mr. WIEBE
- Ms. WIGHT

Substitutions received prior to committee proceedings on November 26, 2013:

- Hon. Mr. ALLUM for Hon. Ms. HOWARD

Committee Membership for the June 26, 2014 meeting:

- Hon. Mr. ALLUM
- Mr. BRIESE
- Mr. CULLEN
- Hon. Mr. GERRARD
- Mr. HELWER (*Chairperson*)
- Mr. JHA
- Mr. MARCELINO
- Mr. SARAN
- Mr. SCHULER
- Mr. WIEBE (*Vice-Chairperson*)
- Ms. WIGHT

Substitution made prior to committee proceedings on June 26, 2014:

- Hon. Mr. ALLUM for Hon. Ms. HOWARD
- Mr. SARAN for Mr. DEWAR
- Mr. BRIESE for Mr. FRIESEN
- Mr. CULLEN for Mr. PEDERSEN

Committee Membership for the September 3, 2014 meeting:

- Ms. ALLAN
- Mr. DEWAR
- Hon. Mr. GERRARD
- Mr. HELWER (*Chairperson*)
- Mr. MARCELINO
- Mr. PEDERSEN
- Mr. SCHULER
- Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS
- Mrs. STEFANSON
- Mr. WIEBE (*Vice-Chairperson*)
- Ms. WIGHT

Substitution made prior to committee proceedings on September 3, 2014:

- Ms. ALLAN for Mr. JHA
- Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS for Hon. Ms. HOWARD
- Mrs. STEFANSON for Mr. FRIESEN

Committee Membership for the January 28, 2015 meeting:

- Hon. Mr. DEWAR
- Hon. Mr. GERRARD
- Mr. HELWER (*Chairperson*)
- Mr. JHA
- Mr. MALOWAY
- Mr. MARCELINO
- Mr. MARTIN
- Mr. PEDERSEN
- Mr. SARAN
- Mr. SCHULER
- Mr. WIEBE (*Vice-Chairperson*)

Substitutions received prior to committee proceedings on January 28, 2015:

- Mr. MARTIN for Mr. FRIESEN
- Mr. SARAN for vacancy

Committee Membership for the May 21, 2015 meeting:

- Hon. Mr. DEWAR
- Mr. FRIESEN
- Hon. Mr. GERRARD

- Mr. GRAYDON
- Mr. HELWER (*Chairperson*)
- Mr. JHA
- Ms. LATHLIN
- Mr. MALOWAY
- Mr. MARCELINO
- Mr. PEDERSEN
- Mr. WIEBE (*Vice-Chairperson*)

Substitution received prior to committee proceedings on May 21, 2015:

- Mr. GRAYDON for Mr. SCHULER

Committee Membership for the September 29, 2015 meeting:

- Mr. FRIESEN
- Hon. Mr. GERRARD
- Mr. HELWER (*Chairperson*)
- Ms. HOWARD
- Mr. JHA
- Mr. MALOWAY
- Mr. MARCELINO
- Mr. PEDERSEN
- Mr. SCHULER
- Mr. STRUTHERS
- Mr. WIEBE (*Vice-Chairperson*)

Substitution received prior to committee proceedings on September 29, 2015:

- Mr. STRUTHERS for Ms. LATHLIN
- Ms. HOWARD for Hon. Mr. DEWAR

Committee Membership for the June 30, 2016 meeting:

- Mr. BINDLE
- Mr. HELWER (*Vice-Chairperson*)
- Mr. JOHNSTON
- Ms. KLASSEN
- Mr. MALOWAY
- Mr. MARCELINO
- Mrs. MAYER
- Mr. MICHALESKI
- Ms. MORLEY-LECOMTE
- Mr. WIEBE (*Chairperson*)
- Mr. YAKIMOSKI

Committee Membership for the August 17, 2016 meeting:

- Mr. BINDLE
- Mr. HELWER (*Vice-Chairperson*)
- Mr. JOHNSTON
- Ms. KLASSEN
- Mr. MALOWAY
- Mr. MARCELINO
- Mrs. MAYER
- Mr. MICHALESKI
- Ms. MORLEY-LECOMTE
- Mr. WIEBE (*Chairperson*)
- Mr. YAKIMOSKI

### **Officials Speaking on Record**

Officials speaking on record at the May 8, 2013 meeting:

- Carol Bellringer, Auditor General of Manitoba
- Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS, Minister of Finance
- John Clarkson, Deputy Minister of Finance

Officials speaking on record at the June 25, 2013 meeting:

- Carol Bellringer, Auditor General of Manitoba

- Hon. Ms. OSWALD, Minister of Health
- Milton Sussman, Deputy Minister of Health

Officials speaking on record at the August 8, 2013 meeting:

- Carol Bellringer, Auditor General of Manitoba
- Doug Harold, Principal
- Fraser McLean, Principal
- Grant Doak, Deputy Minister of Innovation, Energy and Mines
- John Clarkson, Deputy Minister of Finance

Officials speaking on record at the October 9, 2013 meeting:

- Carol Bellringer, Auditor General of Manitoba
- Hon. Ms. MELNICK, Minister of Immigration and Multiculturalism
- Hugh Eliasson, Deputy Minister of Immigration and Multiculturalism

Officials speaking on record at the October 30, 2013 meeting:

- Carol Bellringer, Auditor General of Manitoba
- Hon. Ms. BRAUN, Minister of Labour and Immigration
- Jeff Parr, Deputy Minister of Labour and Immigration
- Hon. Ms. HOWARD, Minister of Finance
- John Clarkson, Deputy Minister of Finance
- Hon. Ms. IRVIN-ROSS, Minister of Family Services
- Joy Cramer, Deputy Minister of Family Services

Officials speaking on record at the November 26, 2013 meeting:

- Carol Bellringer, Auditor General of Manitoba
- Sandra Cohen, Assistant Auditor General
- Hon. Ms. IRVIN-ROSS, Minister of Family Services
- Joy Cramer, Deputy Minister of Family Services

Officials speaking on record at the June 26, 2014 meeting:

- Brian Wirth, Assistant Auditor General of Manitoba
- Hon. Mr. ASHTON, Minister of Infrastructure and Transportation
- Doug McNeil, Deputy Minister of Infrastructure and Transportation

Officials speaking on record at the September 3, 2014 meeting:

- Norm Ricard, Acting Auditor General of Manitoba
- Tyson Shtykalo, Assistant Auditor General
- Jim Hrichishen, Deputy Minister of Finance

Officials Speaking on Record at the January 28, 2015 meeting:

- Norm Ricard, Acting Auditor General of Manitoba
- Hon. Mr. DEWAR, Minister of Finance
- Jim Hrichishen, Deputy Minister of Finance

Officials speaking on record at the May 21, 2015 meeting:

- Norm Ricard, Acting Auditor General of Manitoba
- Hon. Mr. CALDWELL, Minister of Municipal Government
- Fred Meier, Deputy Minister of Municipal Government

Officials speaking on record at the September 29, 2015 meeting:

- Norm Ricard, Auditor General of Manitoba
- Hon. Mr. CHIEF, Minister of Jobs and the Economy
- Hugh Eliasson, Deputy Minister of Jobs and the Economy

Officials speaking on record at the August 17, 2016 meeting:

- Norm Ricard, Auditor General of Manitoba
- Sandra Cohen, Assistant Auditor General
- Hon. Mr. WISHART, Minister of Education
- Bramwell Strain, Deputy Minister of Education

## **Agreements:**

Your Committee agreed to conclude consideration of the following chapters of the Auditor General's Report – Annual Report to the Legislature dated January 2013:

- Chapter 1 – *Accounts and Financial Statements: Section 10 Annual Report* at the January 28, 2015 meeting.
- Chapter 2 – *Citizen Concerns - "Part 1 - Business Transformation and Technology (BTT)"* at the August 8, 2013 meeting.
- Chapter 2 – *Citizen Concerns – "Part 2 – Disaster Financial Assistance"* at the June 26, 2014 meeting.
- Chapter 2 – *Citizen Concerns – "Part 3 – Employment and Income Assistance Program"* at the September 29, 2015 meeting.
- Chapter 2 – *Citizen Concerns – "Part 4 – North Portage Development Corporation"* at the May 21, 2015 meeting.
- Chapter 3 – *Information Technology (IT) Security Management* at the June 26, 2014 meeting.
- Chapter 4 – *Manitoba Early Learning and Child Care Program* at the June 26, 2014 meeting.
- Chapter 5 – *Manitoba eHealth Procurement of Contractors* at the June 26, 2014 meeting.
- Chapter 6 – *Office of the Fire Commissioner* at the June 30, 2016 meeting.
- Chapter 7 – *Provincial Nominee Program for Business* at the August 17, 2016 meeting.
- Chapter 8 – *Senior Management Expense Policies* June 26, 2014 meeting.

At the October 30, 2013 meeting, your Committee agreed to refer the following agenda items to a future meeting:

- Chapter 4 – *Manitoba Early Learning and Child Care Program* of the Auditor General's Report – Annual Report to the Legislature dated January 2013.

At the August 17, 2016 meeting, your committee agreed to conclude consideration of the following sections of the Auditor General's Report – Follow-Up of Previously Issued Recommendations – dated May 2015:

- Section 8 – *Special Needs Education*,
- Section 14 – *Manitoba Early Learning and Child Care Program*
- Section 17 – *Provincial Nominee Program for Business*

At the August 17, 2016 meeting, your committee agreed to conclude consideration of the following sections of the Auditor General's Report – Follow-Up of Previously Issued Recommendations – dated May 2016:

- *Special Needs Education*,
- *Manitoba Early Learning and Child Care Program*
- *Provincial Nominee Program for Business*

## **Report Considered and Adopted:**

Your Committee has considered the following report and has adopted the same as presented:

- Auditor General's Report – Annual Report to the Legislature – dated January 2013
- Auditor General's Report – Improving Educational Outcomes for Kindergarten to Grade 12 Aboriginal Students – dated January 2016

## **Reports Considered but not Passed:**

Your Committee has considered the following reports but did not pass it:

- Auditor General's Report – Follow-Up of Previously Issued Recommendations – dated May 2015 (*Section 8 – Special Needs Education, Section 14 – Manitoba Early Learning and Child Care Program, Section 17 – Provincial Nominee Program for Business – concluded consideration of*)
- Auditor General's Report – Follow-Up of Previously Issued Recommendations – dated May 2016 (*Special Needs Education, Manitoba Early Learning and Child Care Program, Provincial Nominee Program for Business – concluded consideration of*)

Submitted by,

---

Mr. Matt WIEBE, Chairperson  
August 17, 2016