## TO THE HONOURABLE THE LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA

Your Standing Committee on Public Accounts presents the following as its Second Report.

## Meetings

Your Committee met on the following occasions:

- February 9, 2011 (5<sup>th</sup> Session, 39<sup>th</sup> Legislature) March 16, 2011 (5<sup>th</sup> Session, 39<sup>th</sup> Legislature)
- May 25, 2011 (5<sup>th</sup> Session, 39<sup>th</sup> Legislature)
- March 21, 2012 (1<sup>st</sup> Session, 40<sup>th</sup> Legislature)
- April 25, 2012 (1<sup>st</sup> Session, 40<sup>th</sup> Legislature)
- October 24, 2012 (1<sup>st</sup> Session, 40<sup>th</sup> Legislature)
- March 20, 2013( $2^{nd}$  Session,  $40^{th}$  Legislature) June 25, 2013 ( $2^{nd}$  Session,  $40^{th}$  Legislature) January 13, 2014 ( $3^{rd}$  Session,  $40^{th}$  Legislature)

- June 26, 2014 (3<sup>rd</sup> Session, 40<sup>th</sup> Legislature)

## **Matters under Consideration**

- Auditor General's Report Annual Report to the Legislature dated January 2013 •
- Chapter 2 Citizen Concerns "Part 2 Disaster Financial Assistance" Auditor General's Report - Annual Report to the Legislature - dated March 2014
- Chapter 9 Northern Airports and Marine Operations
- Auditor General's Report Report to the Legislative Assembly: Performance Audits dated December 2010
  - *Chapter 1 Managing Climate Change*
- Auditor General's Report Follow-Up of Previously Issued Recommendations dated March 2011
  - o Section 18 Maintenance Enforcement Program
  - Auditor General's Report Annual Report to the Legislature dated January 2013
    - Chapter 3 Information Technology (IT) Security Management
    - 0 Chapter 4 – Manitoba Early Learning and Child Care Program
    - o Chapter 5 Manitoba eHealth Procurement of Contractors
    - Chapter 8 Senior Management Expense Policies

# **Committee Membership**

Committee Membership for the February 9, 2011 meeting:

- Ms. BRAUN •
- Ms. BRICK
- Mr. DERKACH (Chairperson)
- Mr. DEWAR (Vice-Chairperson)
- Mrs. DRIEDGER
- Hon. Mr. GERRARD
- Mr. MARTINDALE
- Mr. PEDERSEN
- Mrs. STEFANSON
- Mr. WHITEHEAD
- Hon. Ms. WOWCHUK •

Committee Membership for the March 16, 2011 meeting:

- Mr. BOROTSIK
- Ms. BRAUN
- Mr. DERKACH (Chairperson)
- Mr. DEWAR (Vice-Chairperson)
- Mrs. DRIEDGER
- Hon. Mr. GERRARD
- Mr. JHA
- Mr. MARTINDALE
- Mrs. STEFANSON
- Mr. WHITEHEAD
- Hon. Ms. WOWCHUK

Substitutions made during the committee proceedings on March 16, 2011:

• Mr. PEDERSEN for Mrs. DRIEDGER

Committee Membership for the May 25, 2011 meeting:

- Mr. BOROTSIK
- Ms. BRAUN
- Mr. DERKACH (Chairperson)
- Mr. DEWAR (Vice-Chairperson)
- Mrs. DRIEDGER
- Mr. JHA
- Mr. MARTINDALE
- Mr. WHITEHEAD
- Ms. STEFANSON
- Hon. Ms. WOWCHUK

Substitutions made prior to committee proceedings on May 25, 2011:

- Ms. BRICK for Mr. WHITEHEAD
- Mr. DYCK for Mrs. DRIEDGER

Committee Membership for the March 21, 2012 meeting:

- Mr. ALLUM
- Ms. BRAUN
- Mr. DEWAR (Vice-Chairperson)
- Hon. Mr. GERRARD
- Mr. HELWER
- Mr. JHA
- Mr. MAGUIRE (*Chairperson*)
- Mr. PEDERSEN
- Mrs. Stefanson
- Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS
- Mr. WHITEHEAD
- Substitution made prior to committee proceedings on March 21, 2012:
- Mr. FRIESEN for Mrs. STEFANSON

Committee Membership for the April 25, 2012 meeting:

- Mr. ALLUM
- Ms. BRAUN
- Mr. DEWAR (Vice-Chairperson)
- Hon. Mr. GERRARD
- Mr. HELWER
- Mr. JHA
- Mr. MAGUIRE (Chairperson)
- Mr. PEDERSEN
- Mrs. Stefanson
- Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS
- Mr. WHITEHEAD

Substitution made prior to committee proceedings on April 25, 2012:

- Mr. FRIESEN for Mrs. STEFANSON
- Ms. WIGHT for Mr. JHA

Committee Membership for the October 24, 2012 meeting:

- Mr. ALLUM
- Ms. BRAUN
- Mr. CULLEN
- Mr. DEWAR (Vice-Chairperson)
- Mrs. DRIEDGER
- Hon. Mr. GERRARD
- Mr. HELWER (*Chairperson*)
- Mr. JHA
- Mr. PEDERSEN
- Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS
- Mr. WHITEHEAD

Committee Membership for the March 20, 2013 meeting:

- Mr. ALLUM
- Ms. BRAUN
- Mr. CULLEN
- Mr. DEWAR (Vice-Chairperson)
- Mrs. DRIEDGER
- Hon. Mr. GERRARD
- Mr. HELWER (*Chairperson*)
- Mr. JHA
- Mr. PEDERSEN
- Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS
- Mr. WHITEHEAD

Substitution made prior to committee proceedings on March 20, 2013:

• Mr. EWASKO for Mrs. DRIEDGER

Committee Membership for the June 25, 2013 meeting:

- Mr. ALLUM
- Ms. BRAUN
- Mr. CULLEN
- Mr. DEWAR (Vice-Chairperson)
- Mrs. DRIEDGER
- Hon. Mr. GERRARD
- Mr. HELWER (*Chairperson*)
- Mr. JHA
- Mr. PEDERSEN
- Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS
- Mr. WHITEHEAD

Committee Membership for the January 13, 2014 meeting:

- Mr. DEWAR (Vice-Chairperson)
- Mr. FRIESEN
- Hon. Mr. GERRARD
- Mr. HELWER (*Chairperson*)
- Hon. Ms. HOWARD
- Mr. JHA
- Mr. PEDERSEN
- Mr. SCHULER
- Mr. WHITEHEAD
- Mr. WIEBE
- Ms. WIGHT

Committee Membership for the June 26, 2014 meeting:

- Mr. DEWAR
- Mr. FRIESEN
- Hon. Mr. GERRARD
- Mr. HELWER (*Chairperson*)
- Hon. Ms. HOWARD
- Mr. JHA
- Mr. MARCELINO
- Mr. PEDERSEN
- Mr. SCHULER
- Mr. WIEBE (Vice-Chairperson)
- Ms. WIGHT

Substitution made prior to committee proceedings on June 26, 2014:

- Hon. Mr. ALLUM for Hon. Ms. HOWARD
- Mr. SARAN for Mr. DEWAR
- Mr. BRIESE for Mr. FRIESEN
- Mr. CULLEN for Mr. PEDERSEN

### **Officials Speaking on Record**

- Officials speaking on the record at the February 9, 2011 meeting:
- Ms. Carol Bellringer, Auditor General of Manitoba
- Mr. Fred Meier, Deputy Minister of Conservation
- Mr. Hugh Eliasson, Deputy Minister of Finance

Officials speaking on the record at the March 16, 2011 meeting:

- Ms. Carol Bellringer, Auditor General of Manitoba
- Mr. Grant Doak, Deputy Minister of Family Services and Consumer Affairs

Officials speaking on record at the May 25, 2011 meeting:

- Ms. Carol Bellringer, Auditor General of Manitoba
- Hon. Mr. CHOMIAK, Minister of Innovation, Energy and Mines
- Mr. John Clark, Deputy Minister of Innovation, Energy and Mines
- Mr. Hugh Eliasson, Deputy Minister of Entrepreneurship, Training and Trade and Deputy Minister of Finance

Officials speaking on the record at the March 21, 2012 meeting:

- Carol Bellringer, Auditor General of Manitoba
- Hon. Ms. SELBY, Minister of Advanced Education and Literacy
- Mr. Gerald Farthing, Deputy Minister of Advanced Education and Literacy
- Ms. Joy Cramer, Deputy Minister of Housing and Community Development
- Mr. Jeffrey Schnoor, Q.C, Deputy Minister of Justice and Attorney General

Officials speaking on record at the April 25, 2012 meeting:

- Carol Bellringer, Auditor General of Manitoba
- Hon. Ms. OSWALD, Minister of Health
- Mr. Milton Sussman, Deputy Minister of Health

Officials speaking on record at the October 24, 2012 meeting:

- Ms. Carol Bellringer, Auditor General of Manitoba
- Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS, Minister of Finance
- Mr. Fred Meier, Deputy Minister of Conservation and Water Stewardship
- Ms. Linda McFadyen, Deputy Minister of Local Government

Officials speaking on record at the March 20, 2013 meeting:

- Ms. Carol Bellringer, Auditor General of Manitoba
- Mr. Hugh Eliasson, Deputy Minister of Entrepreneurship, Training and Trade

Officials speaking on record at the June 25, 2013 meeting:

- Carol Bellringer, Auditor General of Manitoba
- Hon. Ms. OSWALD, Minister of Health
- Mr. Milton Sussman, Deputy Minister of Health

Officials speaking on record at the January 13, 2014 meeting:

- Ms. Carol Bellringer, Auditor General of Manitoba
- Hon. Mr. STRUTHERS, Minister of Finance
- Mr. Fred Meier, Deputy Minister of Conservation and Water Stewardship

Officials speaking on record at the June 26, 2014 meeting:

- Mr. Brian Wirth, Assistant Auditor General of Manitoba
- Hon. Mr. ASHTON, Minister of Infrastructure and Transportation
- Mr. Doug McNeil, Deputy Minister of Infrastructure and Transportation

#### Agreements:

Your Committee agreed to conclude consideration of the following chapters of the Auditor General's Report – Report to the Legislative Assembly: Performance Audits – dated December 2010:

- Chapter 1 *Managing Climate Change* at the June 26, 2014 meeting.
- Chapter 2 *Economic Development: Loans and Investments under The Development Corporation Act* at the March 20, 2013 meeting.

- Chapter 3 Special Audit: Society for Manitobans with Disabilities at the March 16, 2011 meeting.
- Chapter 4 *Special Audit: Rural Municipality of St. Laurent* at the January 13, 2014 meeting.

Your Committee agreed to conclude consideration of the following sections of the Auditor General's Report – Follow-Up of Previously Issued Recommendations – dated March 2011:

- Section 1 *Audit of the Pharmacare Program* at the June 25, 2013 meeting.
- Section 3 *The Protection of Well Water Quality in Manitoba* at the October 24, 2012 meeting.
- Section 6 University of Winnipeg Investment in Information Technology at the March 21, 2012 meeting.
- Section 7 University of Winnipeg Financial Review at the March 21, 2012 meeting.
- Section 8 Department of Advanced Education Student Financial Assistance Program at the March 21, 2012 meeting.
- Section 9 *Keewatin Community College Investment in Information Technology* at the March 21, 2012 meeting.
- Section 10 *Red River College of Applied Arts, Science and Technology IT Audit* at the March 21, 2012 meeting.
- Section 14 Department of Family Services and Housing Public Housing Program at the March 21, 2012 meeting.
- Section 15 *Investigation of the Maintenance Branch of Manitoba Housing* at the March 21, 2012 meeting.
- Section 18 *Maintenance Enforcement Program* at the June 26, 2014 meeting.

Your Committee agreed to conclude consideration of *Chapter 2 – Citizen Concerns – "Part 2 – Disaster Financial Assistance"* of the Auditor General's Report – Annual Report to the Legislature dated January 2013 at the June 26, 2014 meeting.

Your Committee agreed to conclude consideration of *Chapter 9 – Northern Airports and Marine Operations* of the Auditor General's Report – Annual Report to the Legislature – dated March 2014 at the June 26, 2014 meeting.

# **Report Considered and Adopted:**

Your Committee has considered the following reports and has adopted the same as presented:

- Auditor General's Report Report to the Legislative Assembly: Performance Audits dated December 2010
- Auditor General's Report Follow-Up of Previously Issued Recommendations dated March 2011

# **Reports Considered but not Passed:**

Your Committee has considered the following reports but did not pass it:

- Auditor General's Report Annual Report to the Legislature dated January 2013 (*Part 2 of Chapter 2 concluded consideration of*)
- Auditor General's Report Annual Report to the Legislature dated March 2014 (*Chapter 9 concluded consideration of*)

Submitted by,