



LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS No. 12

SECOND SESSION, FORTY-THIRD LEGISLATURE

PRAYER AND LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

10:00 O’CLOCK A.M.

Immediately following the Prayer and Land Acknowledgement, the Official Opposition House Leader rose on a point of order regarding the Honourable Minister of Agriculture not wearing a tie.

And Hon. Mr. WIEBE having spoken to the point of order,

And Hon. Mr. KOSTYSHYN agreeing to wear a tie,

WHEREUPON the matter was resolved.

Mrs. COOK moved:

THAT Bill (No. 215) – The Specialist Wait Time Reporting Act/Loi sur la présentation de rapports concernant les temps d’attente pour la consultation de spécialistes, be now read a Second Time and be referred to a Committee of this House.

And a debate arising,

And Mrs. COOK having spoken,

And MLA DEVGAN, Mr. BALCAEN and MLAs PANKRATZ and BEREZA having questioned the Member,

And the debate continuing,

And MLAs PANKRATZ and BEREZA having spoken,

And Hon. Min. MOROZ speaking at 11:00 a.m. The debate was allowed to remain in their name.

During the debate on Bill (No. 215), the House agreed to waive Rule 20 from 1:30 p.m. until the end of Members’ Statements, and to waive its practices regarding addressing Members in the House for the duration of Members’ Statements for today.

Mr. JACKSON moved:

Resolution No. 1: Calling on the Provincial Government to Reverse Recent Amendments to the Teaching Certificates and Qualifications Regulation

WHEREAS the Provincial Government has recklessly amended the Teaching Certificates and Qualifications Regulation under The Education Administration Act, significantly lowering the standards for educational excellence and subject-area expertise required for teacher certification; and

WHEREAS ensuring that teachers have strong backgrounds in the subjects they teach is essential for maintaining high-quality education, fostering well-rounded learning experiences, and preparing Manitoba students to succeed in an increasingly competitive world; and

WHEREAS these changes have eliminated all subject-area requirements for teacher certification, including teachable majors and minors and subject-specific standards for early-middle years education, effectively gutting the professional rigor expected for Manitoba's education system; and

WHEREAS the Provincial Government failed to consult parents, post-secondary educators, and business leaders before implementing these reckless amendments, demonstrating a troubling disregard for transparency and accountability; and

WHEREAS weakening teacher certification standards undermines the integrity of Manitoba's education system and compromises the future success of students; and

WHEREAS alternatives exist to address teacher shortages while upholding rigorous subject-area standards; and

WHEREAS more than 1,000 Manitobans have voiced their opposition to these reckless amendments and signed petitions calling on the Provincial Government to reverse the changes and reinstate the requirements, reflecting widespread public concern about the Provincial Government's educational policies.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba condemn the Provincial Government for lowering teacher training standards in Manitoba and urge the Provincial Government to immediately reverse the reckless amendments to the Teaching Certificates and Qualifications Regulation.

And a debate arising,

And Mr. JACKSON having spoken,

And MLA DELA CRUZ and Messrs. EWASKO, SCHULER and PERCHOTTE having questioned the Member,

And the debate continuing,

And MLA CROSS and Mr. EWASKO having spoken,

And Hon. Min. CABLE speaking at 12:00 p.m. The debate was allowed to remain in their name.

Thursday, December 5, 2024

During the debate, the Deputy Government House Leader rose on a point of order regarding remarks by the Honourable Member by Lac du Bonnet that allegedly questioned the impartiality of the Chair, and requested that the remarks be withdrawn.

And Mr. JOHNSON having spoken to the point of order,

WHEREUPON the Deputy Speaker advised the House he would take the matter under advisement.

1:30 O’CLOCK P.M.

The following Bill was read a First Time and had its purposes outlined:

(No. 5) – The Highway Traffic Amendment Act (Impaired Driving Measures)/Loi modifiant le Code de la route (mesures en cas d’infractions de conduite avec facultés affaiblies)

(Hon. Mr. WIEBE)

Hon. Min. FONTAINE, the Minister responsible for Women and Gender Equity, made a statement regarding December 6, 2024, being the National Day of Remembrance and Action on Violence Against Women.

Ms. BYRAM commented on the statement.

Pursuant to sub-rule 28(1), MLA CROSS, Mr. EWASKO, MLAs DELA CRUZ and BEREZA and Mr. BRAR made Member’s statements.

Following Oral Questions, the Speaker made the following ruling:

At the conclusion of Petitions on November 22, 2024, the Honourable Opposition House Leader rose on a matter of privilege alleging that during the Honourable Government House Leader’s Member’s statement earlier in the same sitting day, she “put words on the record that were part of her ministerial responsibilities”, and suggested that those comments be redacted from the Hansard transcript.

The Member was reminded by the Deputy Speaker that he had neglected to conclude his matter with a motion, and allowed him the opportunity to move:

THAT this be put to an all-members committee and reported back to the House.

The Honourable Minister of Labour and Immigration spoke to the matter before the Deputy took it under advisement. As the House knows, for a matter of privilege to be ruled as a *prima facie* case, the Member must demonstrate the issue has been raised at the earliest opportunity, while also providing sufficient evidence that the privileges of the House have been breached.

On the condition of timeliness, the Member made no indication in his submission whether he met the required test. As the incident he described happened earlier that same sitting day, I am willing to say that the Member met the test of timeliness with his submission. In future, I would expect this to be addressed by the Member when bringing the matter to the Presiding Officer's attention.

Regarding the second condition of whether a *prima facie* case was demonstrated, many Manitoba Speakers have ruled previously that a matter concerning the methods by which the House proceeds in the conduct of business is a matter of order, not privilege. Joseph Maingot states on page 13 in the second edition of *Parliamentary Privilege in Canada* that "allegations of breach of privilege by a Member in the House that amount to complaints about procedures and practices in the House are by their very nature matters of order". He also states on page 223 of the same edition, "A breach of a Standing Order or failure to follow an established practice would invoke a point of order rather than a question of privilege". It is clear to me that a *prima facie* case of privilege was not established in this matter.

There are several other issues I would like to address.

First, for the information of all Members, we do not redact comments from Hansard. Hansard produces the verbatim transcript of House proceedings, which reflects the history of what is said in this place. We do not edit history.

Second, the Official Opposition House Leader failed to articulate in his submission if and how his privileges as a Member of this Assembly had been breached. Furthermore, the issue he raised was one that the Deputy Speaker addressed at the time it took place, and upon reading the Hansard transcript of that intervention, had been resolved in a procedurally correct manner. In raising this issue the way he did, the Member came dangerously close to reflecting on the Chair, something that I have very recently cautioned all Members against doing.

Third, I would like to take this opportunity to clarify our rules and practices governing Ministers making Member's statements. Our sub-rule 28(2) states, "A Minister of the Crown may not use the time allotted for Member's Statements to comment on government policy or ministerial or [department] action". Members might not be aware of this, but this Rule has been in effect since 1996, when this item of Routine Proceedings was created. Members' Statements, as we know them today, were based on an item of business called "Non-Political Statements", which were exclusively for Members to raise awareness of constituency-based issues or celebrating constituents. Ministers were only permitted to make non-political statements by leave of the House, and their comments had to be solely related to constituency matters.

I think it is worth sharing that, over the last 18 years, there have been multiple instances of Speakers cautioning Honourable Ministers from both sides of the House who were in breach of this Rule, including caucus colleagues of the Official Opposition House Leader. This is a matter that, as Speaker, I am very aware of and will continue to rule on, as past Speakers have done before me. I would encourage all Ministers to heed the words of Speaker Hickes, who concluded his 2001 ruling on a similar matter with the following: "I would suggest to Honourable Ministers that if they are rising to speak on Members' Statements, that the comments should be pertaining to the Minister's constituency, and should not be used to comment on government policy or ministerial or department action."

Lastly, the Official Opposition House Leader initially failed to conclude his submission with a motion, which could have required the Presiding Officer to immediately rule this matter of privilege out of order and dismiss it. The Deputy Speaker was under no obligation to remind the Member to do this, and this warning to all Members not to expect such generosity in future.

On a related note, parliamentary privilege is perhaps one of the most important principles under which this institution functions. A breach of privilege is a grave matter. In the last 30 years in this place, there have been hundreds of matters of privilege raised by all sides of the House, and only two of them were found to be *prima facie* cases. Many of those matters raised could be described as frivolous and arguably disrespectful to this House. To be clear on this issue, no side is blameless. I urge all Members to take greater care and consideration in the future when researching and raising such matters, and not to raise matters of a frivolous nature under the banner of privilege.

I thank you all for your attention to this ruling.

From his decision, Mr. JOHNSON appealed to the House.

And the Question being put, “Shall the ruling of the Chair be sustained?”

It was agreed to, on the following division:

AYE

ASAGWARA	MARCELINO
BLASHKO	MOROZ
BRAR	MOSES
BUSHIE	MOYES
CABLE	NAYLOR
CHEN	OXENHAM
COMPTON	PANKRATZ
CROSS	REDHEAD
DELA CRUZ	SALA
DEVGAN	SANDHU
FONTAINE	SCHMIDT
KENNEDY	SCHOTT
KINEW	SIMARD
KOSTYSHYN	SMITH
LOISELLE	WIEBE30

NAY

BALCAEN	KHAN
BEREZA	KING
BYRAM	LAGASSÉ
COOK	NARTH
EWASKO	NESBITT
GOERTZEN	PERCHOTTE
GUENTER	PIWNIUK
HIEBERT	SCHULER
JACKSON	STONE
JOHNSON	WOWCHUK..... 20

By leave, the House agreed that the title of Bill (No. 10) as it currently appears on the Notice Paper be replaced with “The Residential Tenancies Amendment Act (2)/Loi n° 2 modifiant la Loi sur la location à usage d’habitation”.

The following petitions were presented and read to the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba:

Mr. PIWNIUK – To urge the Provincial Government to immediately put forward a plan to increase breast cancer screening capacity and lower the breast cancer screening age to 40.

Mr. EWASKO – To urge the Provincial Government to remove the federal carbon tax on home heating bills for all Manitobans to provide them much needed relief.

Mr. PERCHOTTE – To urge the Minister of Education and Early Childhood Learning to reverse recent amendments to the Teaching Certificates and Qualifications Regulation that weaken subject-area requirements for teacher certification, and to reinstate teachable majors and minors and early-middle years requirements, which are essential for ensuring teachers have strong knowledge in core subject areas; and to urge the Provincial Government to address teacher shortages through alternative measures that uphold rigorous subject-area standards, which are critical for providing quality education to all Manitoba students.

Mr. BALCAEN – To urge the Premier to financially assist the City of Winnipeg on building this three-lane bridge in each direction to maintain this vital link between northeast Winnipeg, Transcona and the downtown; to urge the Provincial Government to recommend that the City of Winnipeg keep the old bridge fully open to traffic while the new bridge is under construction; and to urge the Provincial Government to consider the feasibility of keeping the old bridge open for active transportation in the future.

MLA BEREZA – To urge the Provincial Government to support the investment and placement of an MRI machine in the Portage Regional Health Facility in Portage la Prairie, Manitoba.

Ms. BYRAM – To urge the Provincial Government to address the conditions of Provincial Trunk Highway 34, making the necessary upgrades to RTAC standard and to resurface the road once the new bridge has been completed.

Mrs. COOK – To urge the Provincial Government to proceed with the planned renovation and expansion of Phoenix School without further delay.

Mr. GUENTER – To urge the Provincial Government to immediately put forward a plan to increase breast cancer screening capacity and lower the breast cancer screening age to 40.

Mrs. HIEBERT – To urge the Provincial Government to take immediate action and recognize the critical need of this wastewater project for economic growth and environmental stability by committing to advocating and working with the Federal Government to close the gap with additional funding for Morden’s wastewater treatment system; and to ensure all levels of government and regulatory bodies will expedite necessary funding and approvals necessary to advance the Morden wastewater project with no further delay and ensure no hindrance to growth and economic development for Morden and southern Manitoba.

Mr. JOHNSON – To urge the Minister of Education and Early Childhood Learning to reverse recent amendments to the Teaching Certificates and Qualifications Regulation that weaken subject-area requirements for teacher certification, and to reinstate teachable majors and minors and early-middle years requirements, which are essential for ensuring teachers have strong knowledge in core subject areas; and to urge the Provincial Government to address teacher shortages through alternative measures that uphold rigorous subject-area standards, which are critical for providing quality education to all Manitoba students.

Mr. JACKSON – To urge the Minister of Education and Early Childhood Learning to reverse recent amendments to the Teaching Certificates and Qualifications Regulation that weaken subject-area requirements for teacher certification, and to reinstate teachable majors and minors and early-middle years requirements, which are essential for ensuring teachers have strong knowledge in core subject areas; and to urge the Provincial Government to address teacher shortages through alternative measures that uphold rigorous subject-area standards, which are critical for providing quality education to all Manitoba students.

Thursday, December 5, 2024

Mr. KING – To urge the Provincial Government to remove the federal carbon tax on home heating bills for all Manitobans to provide them much needed relief.

MLA LAGASSÉ – To urge the Provincial Government to immediately put forward a plan to increase breast cancer screening capacity and lower the breast cancer screening age to 40.

The House then adjourned at 5:00 p.m. until 1:30 p.m. Wednesday, March 5, 2025.

Hon. Tom LINDSEY,
Speaker.