



**LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA**

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS No. 37**

**FOURTH SESSION, FORTY-FIRST LEGISLATURE**

**PRAYER**

**1:30 O'CLOCK P.M.**

On motion of Hon. Mr. PEDERSON, Bill (No. 22) – The Business Registration, Supervision and Ownership Transparency Act (Various Acts Amended)/Loi sur l'enregistrement, la surveillance et la transparence de la propriété effective des entreprises (modification de diverses dispositions législatives), was read a First Time and had its purposes outlined.

Hon. Ms. SQUIRES presented:

Annual Report of Manitoba Hydro Demand Side Management for fiscal year ending March 31, 2018.

(Sessional Paper No. 29)

Hon. Mr. PEDERSON presented:

Annual Report of The Manitoba Labour Board for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2018.

(Sessional Paper No. 30)

Pursuant to Rule 27(1), Hon. Ms. SQUIRES, Messrs. LINDSEY and MICHALESKI, Ms. FONTAINE and Mr. JOHNSTON made Members' Statements.

Following Oral Questions, Ms. FONTAINE rose on a Matter of Privilege regarding comments made by the Honourable Member for St. Norbert directed at the Honourable Member for Logan.

And Mr. REYES having voluntarily apologized to the House,

WHEREUPON Madam Speaker noted that with the apology, the matter was resolved.

Subsequently following Oral Questions, Madam Speaker made the following ruling:

On March 15, 2019 the Honourable Member for Concordia raised a matter of privilege contending that comments made by the Honourable Minister of Education had breached the privileges of the House because a letter had been received by the Chair of the Winnipeg School Division Board of Trustees requesting an apology for remarks made by the Minister. At the conclusion of his remarks, the Honourable Member for Concordia moved “THAT the Minister of Education’s statements, which are an attack on the administration of Manitoba school boards, be moved to an all-party committee immediately.” The Honourable Government House Leader also offered advice to the Chair. I took the matter under advisement in order to consult the procedural authorities.

I thank both Honourable Members for their contributions to the matter of privilege.

In raising privilege, Members must satisfy two conditions in order for the matter to be ruled in order as a prima facie case of privilege. It needs to be demonstrated that the issue was raised at the earliest opportunity, and also that sufficient evidence has been provided to demonstrate that the privileges of the House have been breached, in order for the matter to be put to the House.

The Honourable Member for Concordia advised that he was raising the issue at the earliest opportunity as he had only received a copy of the letter a few minutes prior, and I accept the word of the Honourable Member that it was the earliest opportunity.

Regarding the second condition of whether a prima facie case of privilege was demonstrated, I would note that House of Commons Speakers Fraser, Parent and Milliken have reminded Members of the importance of exercising fairness with respect to those who are not in a position to defend themselves. This sentiment can be found on pages 98 and 99 of *House of Commons Procedure and Practice*, Third edition by Bosc and Gagnon, however it is also important to remember that it is not a violation of privilege for a Member to express opinions under the protection of freedom of speech.

I would reiterate for the House that parliamentary privilege provides protection for Members of the Legislative Assembly but does not protect the public or civil servants, as has been ruled in the House on numerous occasions by Speakers Walding, Dacquay, Hickes and Reid. The Minister is protected by privilege for comments that he makes in the House under the protection of freedom of speech. Persons outside of the House can contact Members requesting apologies for comments made by Members in the House if they so wish, but it is not a violation of the privileges of the House if individuals write to request such an apology. Nor can Members be held liable for statements made during a proceeding of Parliament or of the Legislature.

With the greatest of respect, I rule that a prima facie case of privilege has not been demonstrated.

From her decision, Ms. FONTAINE appealed to the House,

And the Question being put, "Shall the ruling of the Chair be sustained?"

It was agreed to, on the following division:

YEA

CLARKE	MICHALESKI
COX	MICKLEFIELD
CULLEN	MORLEY-LECOMTE
EICHLER	NESBITT
EWASKO	PEDERSEN
FRIESEN	PIWNIUK
GOERTZEN	SMITH (Southdale)
GUILLEMARD	SMOOK
HELWER	SQUIRES
ISLEIFSON	STEFANSON
JOHNSON	TEITSMA
JOHNSTON	WHARTON
LAGASSÉ	WISHART
LAGIMODIERE	WOWCHUK
MARTIN	YAKIMOSKI..... 31
MAYER	

NAY

ALLUM	MALOWAY
FONTAINE	MARCELINO (Logan)
GERRARD	MARCELINO (Tyndall Park)
KLASSEN	SARAN
LAMONT	SMITH (Point Douglas)
LAMOUREUX	SWAN
LINDSEY	WIEBE ..... 14

---

The following petitions were presented and read:

Ms. KLASSEN – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Provincial Government to increase funding for licensed not for profit child care programs in recognition of the importance of early learning and child care in Manitoba which will also improve quality and stability in the workforce.

Mr. GRAYDON – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Provincial Government to amend *The Official Time Act* to abolish daylight saving time in Manitoba effective November 4, 2019, resulting in Manitoba remaining on Central Standard Time (CST) throughout the year and in perpetuity. (P. French, J. French, B. Remus and others)

Hon. Mr. GERRARD – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Provincial Government to increase funding for licensed not for profit child care programs in recognition of the importance of early learning and child care in Manitoba which will also improve quality and stability in the workforce. (A. Desjardins, A. Scrini, C. Burns and others)

Mr. LAMONT – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Provincial Government to increase funding for licensed not for profit child care programs in recognition of the importance of early learning and child care in Manitoba which will also improve quality and stability in the workforce. (C. Rak, M. Epp, A. Curran and others)

Ms. LAMOUREUX – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Provincial Government to increase funding for licensed not for profit child care programs in recognition of the importance of early learning and child care in Manitoba which will also improve quality and stability in the workforce.

Mr. ALLUM – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Provincial Government to increase funding for licensed not for profit child care programs in recognition of the importance of early learning and child care in Manitoba which will also improve quality and stability in the workforce. (C. Bisson, D. Lambert, P. Deschamps and others)

Mr. LINDSEY – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Provincial Government to reinstate obstetric delivery services at Flin Flon General Hospital and work with the Government of Saskatchewan, and the Federal Government, to ensure obstetric services continue to be available on a regional basis. (T. Martin, S. Wheeler, M. Blackman and others)

Ms. MARCELINO (Logan) – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Provincial Government to increase funding for licensed not for profit child care programs in recognition of the importance of early learning and child care in Manitoba which will also improve quality and stability in the workforce. (L. Johnson, L. Pham, H. Heather and others)

Ms. FONTAINE – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Provincial Government to increase funding for licensed not for profit child care programs in recognition of the importance of early learning and child care in Manitoba which will also improve quality and stability in the workforce. (L. Johnson, C. Vechina, I. Droux and others)

Mr. MARCELINO (Tyndall Park) – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Provincial Government to increase funding for licensed not for profit child care programs in recognition of the importance of early learning and child care in Manitoba which will also improve quality and stability in the workforce.

Mr. WIEBE – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Provincial Government to increase funding for licensed not for profit child care programs in recognition of the importance of early learning and child care in Manitoba which will also improve quality and stability in the workforce. (R. Jones, L. Rempel, J. Palathiski and others)

Mrs. SMITH (Point Douglas) – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to request that the Provincial Government consider establishing a cross-departmental team to provide leadership on a culturally appropriate, coordinated response to the growing addictions crisis in our province that includes an aggressive, wide-spread education campaign on the dangers of using methamphetamine and opiates along with addictions education for front-line medical staff in health care facilities, to consider providing additional addictions services in Brandon and Western Manitoba across the continuum of care including acute response, detoxification, long-term rehabilitation, transitional housing, and support for managing co-occurring disorders, to request that the Minister of Health, Seniors and Active Living consider establishing a publicly available inventory of all addictions facilities in Manitoba and to consider providing supports for the families of people struggling with addiction including counseling, patient navigation and advocacy, and direct access to free naloxone. (D. Webster, L. Hoglaida, J. Thomson and others)

Mr. SWAN – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Provincial Government to increase funding for licensed not for profit child care programs in recognition of the importance of early learning and child care in Manitoba which will also improve quality and stability in the workforce. (T. Thompson, B. Thompson, A. McDonald and others)

---

The House resumed the debate on the Proposed Motion of Hon. Mr. FIELDING:

THAT Bill (No. 16) – The Budget Implementation and Tax Statutes Amendment Act, 2019/Loi d'exécution du budget de 2019 et modifiant diverses dispositions législatives en matière de fiscalité, be now read a Second Time and be referred to a Committee of this House.

And the debate continuing,

And Ms. MARCELINO (Logan) having spoken,

And Mr. SARAN speaking at 5:00 p.m. The debate was allowed to remain in his name.

---

The House then adjourned at 5:00 p.m. until 10:00 a.m. Thursday, April 11, 2019.

Hon. Myrna DRIEDGER,  
Speaker.