

Thursday, April 16, 1998



## LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA

### VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS No. 32

FOURTH SESSION, THIRTY-SIXTH LEGISLATURE

#### PRAYERS

10:00 O'CLOCK A.M.

Madam Speaker having left the Chair and the House resolving itself into a Committee to consider of the Supply to be granted to Her Majesty;

And the House continuing in Committee, the Proceedings were interrupted at 12:00 p.m. with the understanding that the Committee of Supply would resume following Routine Proceedings.

1:30 O'CLOCK P.M.

The following petitions were presented:

Mr. HICKES - Minister of Health to put an end to the centralization and privatization of Winnipeg hospital food services (M. Juzwa, K. Phengpacy, D. Guenette and others)

Mr. MALOWAY - Minister of Health to put an end to the centralization and privatization of Winnipeg hospital food services (K. Wilding, M. Lalonde, M. Youzwa and others)

Mr. DEWAR - Minister of Health to put an end to the centralization and privatization of Winnipeg hospital food services (M. Masserey, R. Boniello, J. L. Snively and others)

Mr. MARTINDALE - Minister of Health to consider immediately cancelling the hospital food proposal and concentrate on delivering quality health care instead of using health dollars to provide contracts for private firms (D. Makoid, M. Sydor, D. Craig and others)

Mr. JENNISSEN - Minister of Health to consider immediately cancelling the hospital food proposal and concentrate on delivering quality health care instead of using health dollars to provide contracts for private firms (P. Verne, T. Proctor and J. Proctor)

Mr. EVANS (Interlake) - Minister of Health to put an end to the centralization and privatization of Winnipeg hospital food services (P. Pellack, P. Ali, L. Bringes and others)

The following petitions were read and received:

Mr. MALOWAY - Minister of Health to put an end to the centralization and privatization of Winnipeg hospital food services (S. Taylor, K. Cox, B. Griffin and others)

**Thursday, April 16, 1998**

---

Mr. HICKES - Minister of Health to put an end to the centralization and privatization of Winnipeg hospital food services (D. Reid, D. Prazno and A. Dancer)

---

By leave, the following petition was read and received:

Ms. BARRETT - Minister of Health to put an end to the centralization and privatization of Winnipeg hospital food services (C. Schulkins, C. Nowicki, K. Medwid and others)

---

Hon. Mr. ENNS presented:

Supplementary Information for Legislative Review - 1998-1999 - Agriculture  
(Sessional Paper No. 161)

---

During Oral Questions, Mr. ASHTON rose on a point of order stating that the Minister of Justice's response to the Member from St. Johns' question contravened Beauchesne Citation 417,

And Hon. Mr. TOEWS and Ms. FRIESEN having spoken to the point of order,

WHEREUPON Madam Speaker informed the House she would take the matter under advisement.

---

Subsequently, during Oral Questions, Mr. MARTINDALE rose on a point of order stating that the Honourable First Minister had not answered the question posed by the Member for Osborne,

And Hon. Mr. FILMON having spoken to the point of order,

WHEREUPON Madam Speaker informed the House she would take the matter under advisement.

---

Pursuant to Rule 20 (1), Mr. HELWER, Ms. WOWCHUK, Messrs. DYCK, MARTINDALE, and LAMOUREUX made Members' Statements.

---

And the House continuing in Committee, the Proceedings were interrupted at 5:00 p.m. for Private Members' Business.

---

**Thursday, April 16, 1998**

---

Mr. CHOMIAK moved:

Resolution No. 15: Making Health Care Governance Accountable

WHEREAS when legislation was introduced in this Legislature establishing Regional Health Authorities across Manitoba, the Minister of Health said it was not “anybody’s intention to get away from any type of accountability for the health care system”; and

WHEREAS since that time, the Government has refused to take responsibility for health care decision making, saying that is it the responsibility of the Boards; and

WHEREAS the Board Chairs and Chief Executive Officers are not elected or accountable to either the people in the region, or to this Legislature; and

WHEREAS the question of accountability has been further complicated because the Provincial Government has insisted that the Boards shouldn’t be elected because they aren’t financially accountable, but conversely says that when financial management issues arise, such as the food services privatization contract signed by the Urban Shared Services Corporation, it is the Regional Boards’ responsibility; and

WHEREAS given the size of the Health Budget, there must be some level of accountability for expenditures and planning; and

WHEREAS since the Minister of Health has tried to abdicate his responsibility for health planning, financial decision making and expenditures, he must agree that the groups he has given that responsibility to should be accountable for their decisions and actions.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba consider the creation of a special Standing Committee on Health Care Reform and Governance; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that this Assembly direct the Minister of Health to be available to that Committee to be accountable for all Provincial Government decisions affecting health programming and reform; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that this Assembly direct the Board Chairs and Chief Executive Officers of all the Regional Health Authorities, including the Winnipeg “Superboards” and the Urban Shared Services Corporation to make themselves available to this Committee to be accountable for their decisions with regard to spending and health care services and priorities.

**Thursday, April 16, 1998**

---

WHEREUPON Madam Speaker ruled as follows:

I must advise the House that Resolution No. 15 as presented by the Honourable Member for Kildonan is not in order. The Speaker, pursuant to citation 566(3) of Beuchesne, has the duty to call the attention of the mover and of the House to the irregularity of a motion; whereupon the motion is usually withdrawn or so modified as to be no longer objectionable. The procedural objection to the resolution arises in the final two "Be It Further Resolved" clauses, specifically the phrases "that this Assembly direct the Minister of Health" and "that this Assembly direct the Board Chairs and Chief Executive Officers of all the Regional Health Authorities."

The Manitoba practice, one which is expressed in Beuchesne citation 553(1), allows for the House to declare its opinions and purposes by way of its resolutions; this does not include the notion of a Private Member's Resolution being a vehicle to direct a Minister or an authority to act in a certain manner or to do a certain thing. Manitoba resolutions have been reviewed and it has been found that wherever the words "direct" or "directing" have been used with reference to the Government or individual Government departments or Ministers, they have been qualified by words such as "urge the Minister to consider (directing)."

If the Honourable Member for Kildonan wishes he can move the resolution again after having made the necessary corrections and having given a new notice, or the Member could seek unanimous consent of the House to submit and have debated in the near future a corrected resolution.

I must at this time rule Resolution No. 15 as it currently reads out of order and it will be removed from the Order Paper.

And leave having been granted to amend the wording in the final clauses to read as follows:

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that this Assembly urge the Minister of Health to be available to that Committee to be accountable for all Provincial Government decisions affecting health programming and reform; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that this Assembly urge the Board Chairs and Chief Executive Officers of all the Regional Health Authorities, including the Winnipeg "Superboards" and the Urban Shared Services Corporation to make themselves available to this Committee to be accountable for their decisions with regard to spending and health care services and priorities.

**Thursday, April 16, 1998**

---

And a debate arising,

And Messrs. CHOMIAK and TWEED, Ms. BARRETT and Mr. McALPINE having spoken,

And Mr. DYCK speaking at 6:00 p.m.,

The debate was allowed to remain in his name.

\_\_\_\_\_

The House then adjourned at 6:00 p.m. until 1:30 p.m. Monday next.

Hon. Louise Dacquay,  
Speaker.